

# Appeal Update Report

Date: November 2023

Planning Appeals

Report of the Director of Planning

Cabinet Member: Councillor CW Horncastle

#### **Purpose of report**

For Members' information to report the progress of planning appeals. This is a monthly report and relates to appeals throughout all 5 Local Area Council Planning Committee areas and covers appeals of Strategic Planning Committee.

#### Recommendations

<u>To note</u> the contents of the report in respect of the progress of planning appeals that have been submitted to and determined by the Planning Inspectorate.

#### **Link to Corporate Plan**

This report is relevant to all of the priorities included in the NCC Corporate Plan 2018-2021 where identified within individual planning applications and appeals.

#### **Key issues**

Each planning application and associated appeal has its own particular set of individual issues and considerations that have been taken into account in their determination, which are set out within the individual application reports and appeal decisions.



## Recent Planning Appeal Decisions

#### **Planning Appeals Allowed (permission granted)**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
20/00230/FUL	Full planning permission for 63 no. dwellings with associated infrastructure and landscaping (as amended) - land south of Broomhouse Lane, Station Road, Prudhoe	No – claim refused
	Main issues: insufficient information to demonstrate that the development would deliver an appropriate mix of housing to meet local housing need; new access with associated disturbance and visual impacts would have a harmful impact on the character and visual amenity of the area and the amenity and living conditions of residents; and insufficient information in respect of energy efficiency measures.	
	Committee Decision – Officer Recommendation: Approve	
22/03128/FUL	Proposed construction of 3 bedroom dormer bungalow – land south east of 4 Studley Drive, Swarland	Yes – claim allowed
	Main issues: loss of landscaping and detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the area; and subdivision of the plot would have a harmful impact on the character and appearance of the area.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
23/01214/VARYCO	Removal of condition 3 (Footpath 1 (HDM)) and 4 (Footpath 2 (HDM)) on approved application 21/04875/FUL - land north of Southcroft Stables, The Croft, Ulgham	Yes – claim allowed
	Main issues: the proposed removal would not promote sustainable connectivity between the wider development and existing infrastructure.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
20/04096/OUT	Outline planning permission for residential development for up to four dwellings (All Matters Reserved) with demolition of existing structures - resubmission of application 19/01511/OUT - land at Moor Farm Estate, Station Road, Stannington	No
	Main issues: proposal would permanently urbanise an open site to the detriment of the rural, dispersed, open	

character of the site and its surroundings.	
Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	

#### **Planning Appeals Split Decision**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

#### Planning Appeals Dismissed (permission refused)

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
22/02870/FUL	Construction of 8no. bungalows with associated access, parking and landscaping – land north of Hartford Court, East West Link Road, Cramlington	No – claim refused
	Main issues: loss of open space; design, density, siting and layout does not respect the character of the area or contribute to a strong sense of place; impacts on residential amenity; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to promote the use of sustainable travel within the development; and absence of completed planning obligation securing a contribution to the Council's Coastal Mitigation Scheme or other suitable mitigation to address effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Northumberland Shore SSSI.  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation:	
	Refuse	
21/02287/FUL	Convert and extend redundant cow byre to residential use (C3) for holiday let – Waterside Cottage, Acklington	No – claim refused
	Main issues: development in an unsustainable location within the open countryside; insufficient information to justify non-mains foul drainage; insufficient information to demonstrate the proposal would not sterilise and identified sand and gravel resource; absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the	

	Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC; and loss of ancient woodland with no exceptional circumstances or suitable compensation strategy.  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
22/03609/AGTRES	Notification of Prior Approval to convert an existing but now redundant agricultural building on the Guyzance Estate for permanent residential use – land south of Waterside Cottage, Acklington	No – claim refused
	Main issues: impacts on adjacent ancient semi- natural woodland and River Coquet and Coquet Valley Woodland SSSI; and absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	
23/00494/FUL	Removal of conservatory to west elevation and construction of two storey side and rear extensions and raising of ridge height – 32 Linden Way, Darras Hall, Ponteland	No
	Main issues: inappropriate design with detrimental impact on the character and visual appearance of the existing dwelling and street scene.	
	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse	

### **Planning Appeals Withdrawn**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

### **Planning Casework Unit Referrals**

Reference No	Proposal and main planning considerations	Award of costs?
None		

## Planning Appeals Received

### **Appeals Received**

Reference No	Description and address	Appeal start date and decision level
21/03396/FUL	Construction of 3no. residential cottages with associated garages, access, car parking and landscaping and demolition of existing outbuilding(s) and extension(s) to 4 & 5 Front Street with replacement extension(s) and internal alterations - 4 and 5 Front Street, Capheaton	2 November 2022 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
	Main issues: proposals are not commensurate with the size of the settlement and encroach into the open countryside, adversely impacting on the setting and appearance of the settlement and surrounding countryside; proposals result in harm to the heritage assets and their setting without clear and convincing justification of this harm or public benefits to outweigh the harm; layout, scale and design as well as pattern of development would be detrimental to local vernacular and character; lack of information on car parking, access arrangements, refuse, drainage and opportunities to promote walking, cycling and public transport; and proposals result in biodiversity net loss.	
21/03397/LBC	Listed Building Consent for demolition of existing outbuilding(s) and extension(s) to 4 & 5 Front Street with replacement extension(s), internal alterations and alterations to boundary walls – 4 and 5 Front Street, Capheaton	2 November 2022 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
	Main issues: proposals result in harm to the heritage assets without clear and convincing justification of this harm or public benefits to outweigh the harm.	
21/01833/FUL	Development of 60 no. Pitches for holiday accommodation comprising touring caravan/campervan pitches and tents – land at Elwick Farm, Belford	10 January 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer
	Main issues: unsustainable major tourism in the open countryside; lack of information in relation to impacts on wildlife; lack of information in respect of a nutrient calculation relating to the Lindisfarne SPA; and lack of information relating to surface	Recommendation: Refuse

	water drainage and highways.	
22/04634/FUL	Demolition of detached garage and construction of side extension – Middlesteads Farm, Longhirst  Main issues: design does not respect the character of the existing dwelling or its locality, would fail to remain subordinate and would result in unacceptable adverse impact on the character of the dwelling and its setting.	16 February 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/01297/FUL	Development of 4 no. residential dwellings including associated access, landscaping and all other ancillary works – land north of junction of Station Road, South End, Longhoughton  Main issues: would fail to preserve the setting of the Grade I listed Church of St Peter and St Paul; harmful impact on the character and appearance of the area; and absence of suitable mitigation to address recreational disturbance with adverse effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Ramsar Site and the North Northumberland Dunes SAC.	21 February 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/02704/CLEXIS	Certificate of Lawful Development – Existing use for the siting of a caravan for residential purposes – land north of east of South Linden House, Longhorsley  Main issues: it is not possible to conclude that the building has been used for a continuous period of 4 years as a dwelling.	27 February 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/03417/OUT	Outline application with some matters reserved for development of one residential dwelling (Self Build); all matters reserved other than access – land north of Hill Top Cottage, Morpeth  Main issues: development within the open countryside; inappropriate development in the open countryside; fails to promote the use of sustainable travel; fails to demonstrate that safe access can be achieved; and fails to demonstrate potential impacts on protected species and how these can be mitigated.	21 March 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/01012/FUL	Conversion of agricultural buildings to create one dwelling including a link extension and detached garage – development site at Barley Hill House Barn, Kiln Pit Hill, Consett Main issues: design fails to reflect the character or appearance of the listed farm	17 May 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse

	building and results in harm to the character and appearance of the listed building.	
22/04060/FUL	Erection 2no 2-storey 4 bed detached dwellings (validated 06/01/23, notice served) - land south west of 21 Front Street, East Bedlington  Main issues: fails to demonstrate that safe access and egress for vehicular, cyclist and pedestrian traffic can be achieved; fails to demonstrate appropriate off-street car parking provision; fails to demonstrate that appropriate ground gas protection has been incorporated into the development; fails to demonstrate how surface water and flood risk will be mitigated on site; and absence of completed planning obligation securing a contribution to the Council's Coastal Mitigation Scheme or other suitable mitigation to address effects on the Northumbria Coast SPA and Northumberland Shore SSSI.	26 May 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/00732/FUL	Retrospective - Proposed full timber decking outdoor seating area with timber frame outbuilding / shed for outdoor store and service area – The Schooner Hotel, 8 Northumberland Street, Alnmouth Main issues: harm to heritage asset and no public benefits have been demonstrated to outweigh the identified harm.	15 June 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/04676/LBC	Listed Building Consent for alterations comprising inserting one window with shutter in South facing gable wall, and the replacement of existing window with fully glazed panel and shutter on West elevation (Amended Description) - The Cottage, Riding Home Farm, Acomb, Hexham  Main issues: less than substantial harm to the character and significance of the listed building that has not been justified.	27 June 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01138/ADE	Advertisement consent for 1no. totem sign – Lidl, Hexham Gate Retail Park, Hexham Main issues: harm to the visual amenity of the site and wider area, including the setting of designated heritage assets and the townscape.	5 July 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/04675/FUL	Proposed 1.5 storey extension to the rear will provide a new staircase; two extensions onto the west gable will provide two storeys of additional living accommodation, plus a single storey link to the updated outbuilding to be clad in timber; the two storey and 1.5	17 July 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:

	storey extensions to have roof pitches; double garage with timber clad; the landscape and ground levels will be updated to provide access to the garage and accommodate the extensions - The Hott, Thorngrafton, Hexham  Main issues: design would not be in keeping with the traditional character and appearance of the dwelling, existing buildings and surrounding area and would be detrimental to visual amenity and fails to preserve the significance of non-designated heritage assets; and insufficient information to consider the archaeological impacts of the development.	Refuse
22/04104/FUL	Change of use, conversion and alteration of the existing buildings to create 6 holiday let units, including landscaping and boundary treatments – 58-60 Middle Street, Spittal Main issues: lack of detail in respect of parking and ecology; and design has not been informed by a structural survey and results in harm to heritage assets.	18 July 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/04526/FUL	Erection of single dwelling with associated access and residential garden – land southeast of The Courtyard, Matfen  Main issues: unsustainable and isolated location within the open countryside; insufficient information to fully consider the ecological impacts of the proposal; and insufficient information to fully consider the impact on existing trees.	16 August 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/03923/FUL	Proposed first floor extension to dwelling house (as amended 25.05.2023) - 14 Castle Street, Norham  Main issues: the development fails to conserve and enhance the Norham Conservation Area and results in harm to the Conservation Area that is not outweighed by public benefits.	18 August 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
22/04546/CLEXIS	Certificate of existing lawful development for the siting of a twin unit caravan for ancillary residential use as an annexe within the existing residential curtilage – Old Field, Catton, Hexham  Main issues: the caravan is not within the residential curtilage so would require planning permission and would have a significant degree of permanency constituting development – the caravan would not be lawful.	24 August 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse

21/04346/FUL	Replace existing building (3no flats/14 no	29 August 2023
	bed sit spaces) with 3no detached houses with 18 bed spaces to be used as holiday accommodation (as amended 20th April 2023) - On the Beach, Harbour Road, Beadnell	Committee Decision - Officer Recommendation: Approve
	Main issues: the proposed units would not enhance and reinforce the local distinctiveness of the conservation area and would not integrate with the surrounding built environment; and identified harm is less than substantial but it has not been demonstrated the public benefit outweighs the harm.	
22/04752/FUL	Change of use and siting of 2no. chalets to be used as holiday accommodation – Rookwood House, Widdrington Village	30 August 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer
	Main issues: development within the open countryside; harm to the setting of the adjacent Grade I listed church; incongruous additions in the open countryside resulting in an urbanising effect of a rural environment; and a unilateral undertaking has not been completed to secure contributions to the coastal mitigation service.	Recommendation: Refuse
23/01093/FUL	Proposed single storey rear extension, extend above roof above and rear dormer addition – Pethfoot Lodge, Cragside  Main issues: incongruous and inappropriate form of development that would be out of character with the existing property and have a harmful impact upon the character and appearance of the site and surrounding area.	5 September 2023  Delegated  Decision - Officer  Recommendation:  Refuse
23/02030/FUL	Proposed erection of holiday dwelling with associated access and residential garden – land south east of The Courtyard, Matfen	15 September 2023
	Main issues: development in the open countryside; and insufficient information to fully consider the ecological impacts of the proposal.	Appeal against non-determination
23/01801/FUL	Proposed two storey front extension and roof alterations – Close House, Whalton	19 September 2023
	Main issues: scale, massing and design would result in disproportionate and unsympathetic additions that would adversely affect the existing dwelling, the character of the Conservation Area and the setting of listed buildings; and insufficient information to assess the ecological impact of the proposals.	Appeal against non-determination
23/00673/FUL	Retrospective: construction of single storey	19 September

	garden room and steps to rear – Newton Post Office, Newton, Stocksfield	2023
	Main issues: harm to the character and appearance of the dwelling, site and the Newton Conservation Area.	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/04617/FUL	The erection of 3no. cyclist accommodation units, associated extension to West House Farm Cottage, installation of solar panels, and associated landscaping and infrastructure – West House Farm Cottage, Shilvington  Main issues: poorly accessible and unsustainable location in the open countryside; and inappropriate development in the Green Belt with no very special circumstances to outweigh the harm.	20 September 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01729/FUL	Extension to garage forming gym and office above – Khalsa Manor, Tranwell Woods	21 September 2023
	Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt and no very special circumstances to outweigh the harm.	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01478/FUL	Construction of second story rear extension, single storey rear extension with glass roof, proposed dormer extension to rear and dormer window to front – 10 Front Street, Newbiggin-by-the-Sea  Main issues: scale, design and positioning would result in an incongruous addition and detract from the character of the Conservation Area; and adverse impact on residential amenity due to loss of sunlight and visual outlook.	21 September 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01363/CLPROP	Certificate of Lawful Development for proposed extension to the rear of existing residential property – Ashleigh, 26 Cade Hill Road, Stocksfield  Main issues: the proposed extension would not be permitted development.	2 October 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
22/03065/LBC	Listed Building Consent for replacement windows – Garden House Cottage, Chollerford  Main issues: proposal fails to preserve the special interest of the listed building resulting in harm that has not been justified.	3 October 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01232/FUL	Outline Application - all matters reserved for a new dwelling in garden of existing dwelling	9 October 2023

	(Self-Build) - West Grange Bungalow, Scots Gap, Morpeth  Main issues: unacceptable and unjustified form of housing development in the open countryside and will not support sustainable modes of transportation.	Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01847/FUL	Demolish existing rear conservatory and proposed rear two storey extension – 50 The Demesne, North Seaton  Main issues: siting, scale and design would result in a disproportionate addition to the dwelling and be incongruous to the character of the dwelling and surrounding area; and harmful impact on residential amenity with regard to outlook, loss of light, privacy and overbearing impact.	10 October 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01881/FUL	Proposed rear single storey extension with roof terrace – 29 Front Street, Newbiggin-by-the-Sea  Main issues: scale, design, materials and positioning would detract from the character of the Conservation Area and the visual amenity of the property and surrounding area; and adverse impact on residential amenity due to loss of privacy.	16 October 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
23/01444/FUL	Change of use: agricultural land to residential car parking facilities associated with residential dwellings – land north of Shaws House Cottages, Newton (Bywell)  Main issues: inappropriate development in the Green Belt and no very special circumstances to outweigh the harm.	19 October 2023 Appeal against non-determination

## Recent Enforcement Appeal Decisions

### **Enforcement Appeals Allowed**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
None		

#### **Enforcement Appeals Dismissed**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
22/00023/NOTICE	Unauthorised stable buildings – Horsley Banks Farm, Horsley	No

#### **Enforcement Appeals Withdrawn**

Reference No	Description and address	Award of costs?
22/00022/NOTICE	Unauthorised dwelling – Horsley Banks Farm, Horsley	No

### **Enforcement Appeals Received**

### **Appeals Received**

Reference No	Description and address	Appeal start date
20/00481/ENDEVT	Change of use of a forestry building for use as residential - English/Wheelings Wood, Corbridge	2 March 2023
21/00865/BRCOND	Construction of retaining wall – Woodlands Rise, Corbridge Road, Hexham	23 March 2023
22/01092/COU	Construction of a multi use arena, erection of an animal shelter and provision of gravelled parking area	25 April 2023
21/00080/ENDEVT	Installation of hardcore - land to north of Kiln Cottage, Newton-on-the-Moor	13 June 2023
20/00504/ENDEVT	Installation of hardstanding for access and 6no. pitches, installation of electricity and water points, installation of a septic tank and erection of building – land north-east of Fieldholme, Embleton	16 October 2023

## Inquiry and Hearing Dates

Reference No	Description and address	Inquiry/hearing date and decision level
21/02077/FUL	Proposed construction of 13no dwellings (including 2no affordable dwellings), creation of new access, car parking and soakaways (amended description) - land south east of The Manor House, Riding Mill  Main issues: harm to the character and appearance of the site and surrounding area and curtilage listed boundary wall; harm to residential amenity; does not make sufficient provision for affordable housing on the site; insufficient information to fully assess the impacts of the proposed development on ecology and biodiversity and net gain for biodiversity; does not secure necessary planning obligations in respect of affordable housing, open space and education.	Hearing – 12-13 September 2023  Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
21/03915/LBC	Listed Building Consent for demolition of a section of existing curtilage listed boundary wall to create access for residential development – land south east of The Manor House, Riding Mill  Main issues: loss of historic fabric and unacceptable alteration of the historic curtilage listed boundary wall.	Hearing 12-13 September 2023 Delegated Decision - Officer Recommendation: Refuse
19/01362/REM	Reserved matters application for appearance, landscaping, layout and scale for proposed 150 residential dwellings (use class C3) including 30% affordable housing, countryside park including car park, pursuant to approved outline planning application 16/00078/OUT (revised description 8th August 2022) - land west of Lancaster Park, Pinewood Drive, Lancaster Park, Morpeth Main issues: by virtue of the layout, scale and appearance, the design fails to preserve or make a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness and the site's surroundings and does not demonstrate high quality sustainable design; and there is no effective and safe access and egress to the existing transport network.	Hearing – 30 August 2023 Committee Decision - Officer Recommendation: Approve

### **Implications**

Policy	Decisions on appeals may affect future interpretation of policy and influence policy reviews
Finance and value for money	There may be financial implications where costs are awarded by an Inspector or where Public Inquiries are arranged to determine appeals
Legal	It is expected that Legal Services will be instructed where Public Inquiries are arranged to determine appeals
Procurement	None
Human resources	None
Property	None
Equalities (Impact Assessment attached?)  □ Yes  √ No □ N/a	Planning applications and appeals are considered having regard to the Equality Act 2010
Risk assessment	None
Crime and disorder	As set out in individual reports and decisions
Customer consideration	None
Carbon reduction	Each application/appeal may have an impact on the local environment and have been assessed accordingly
Wards	All where relevant to application site relating to the appeal
Wards	accordingly  All where relevant to application site relating to the

#### **Background papers**

Planning applications and appeal decisions as identified within the report.

#### Report author and contact details

Elizabeth Sinnamon Development Service Manager Elizabeth.Sinnamon@northumberland.gov.uk